

RESULTS

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

January 28, 2021

4:30 P.M.

"virtually via ZoomWebinar"

1. Appointment of Chairperson.

APP. NO. 2101-28-1

MOTION: The Board moves to appoint Lindsay Vanslambrook to Chairperson.

MADE BY: <u>WILSON</u> SECOND: <u>HUEY</u> VOTE: FOR <u>4</u> AGAINST <u>0</u> (LV recused)

2. 5 Cedar Street - - TMS # 460-01-01-061

APP. NO. 2101-28-2

Requesting conceptual approval for additional height. (2.5 story height district)

Not rated (East Central) New Construction Historic Materials Demo District

Owner: Chamberlain Chestnut Applicant: Chamberlain Chestnut

MOTION: Deferral for general architectural direction, with staff comments noted except

comment number three to be reduced to ten-feet; and future submittals reviewed by

staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

- 1. The size of the front elevation windows are quite large and should be reduced.
- 2. The bay at front should either be eliminated, or made deeper, with supporting brackets of some sort.
- 3. The garage door is far too wide and should be reduced to a width of nine-feet, and recessed as far as possible.
- 4. The fenestration on all elevations should be restudied for balance and consistency.
- 5. The rear doors should be reduced to a single entry door and window.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for general architectural direction, with future submittals reviewed at the staff level.

3. **56 Cannon Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-040**

APP. NO. 2101-28-3

Request conceptual approval for new construction of two single-family houses in rear, and new masonry wall at front.

New Construction (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. 1865(main) Old City District

Owner: Charleston STR 56 LLC

Applicant: Andrew Gould

DEFERRED by staff

4. 250 Rutledge Avenue - - TMS # 460-08-01-155 APP. NO. 2101-28-4

Requesting conceptual approval for rear addition to existing duplex.

Category 4 (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. 1895 Old City District

Owner: Scott Hetterman

Applicant: Neil Stevenson Architects

MOTION: Denial for height, scale, and mass; and general architectural direction.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR $\underline{5}$ AGAINST $\underline{0}$

January 28, 2021 Page | **2**

Staff Comments:

- 1. The guiding principles of Charleston's zoning ordinance require additions to be subordinate in height, scale and mass to the primary historic volume. This proposal warrants restudy so that the historic spacial relationships are retained.
- 2. The proposal has several elements such as the dormer windows, volume width, siding material and roof deck that can be modified to better relate to the existing building.

Staff Recommendation: Denial for height, scale, and mass, and for general architectural direction

5. 234 Ashley Avenue - - TMS # 460-11-02-031

APP. NO. 2101-28-5

Request final approval for paint color change to "Inkwell" on main body.

Category (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. 1855 Old and Historic District

Owner: Anthony Martinez
Applicant: Rodrigo Reyes

MOTION: Denial as submitted.

MADE BY: WILSON SECOND: MARTN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

- 1. While paint is ephemeral and personal, this color mutes the architectural details and building texture that typical colors highlight such as on door trim, and windows.
- 2. As stated in the ordinance, BAR has the authority to deny intense or lurid colors.

Staff Recommendation: Denial.

6. 1 Michel Place - - TMS # 457-12-01-036

APP. NO. 2101-28-6

Request conceptual approval for the elevation of historic residence.

Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. 1888 Old and Historic District

Owner: Robert Vanderwege Applicant: MG Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments 1,3-6; Board comment to retain a corner

board on the north side to demarcate infill; and final review by staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR $\underline{5}$ AGAINST $\underline{0}$

Staff Comments:

- This is a simple elevation but the most visible corner on Michel Place is where the additional stairs will be located. The alteration of that space is positive with the removal of the unusual entrance door.
- The existing fenestration is somewhat disordered, and it would be best for the new windows to complement the existing. The new windows in the stair tower should relate to the north and east elevations. The precedent windows should be the four-over-four light pattern and duplicate the sashes on the east elevation (except for the side-lights).
- 3. Further develop the columns on the south elevation to be less planar relevant to the beam, and articulated identically (note: drawings show west most column as different).
- 4. Handrail selection and pickets are important to consider in final details.
- Refine the detailing of the door surround, hood and bracket elements at the entrance.
- 6. Drawings should reflect the retention and elevation of chimney rather than rebuild. If it is determined during work that rebuilding is necessary, submit the additional scope of work to BAR staff.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

7. 5 Glebe Street - - TMS # 475*04-01-028

APP. NO. 2101-28-7

Requesting final approval for renovation including modifications to entry steps and ramp. Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1840 Old and Historic District

Owner: MT Zion AME Church
Applicant: WS Beckham, Architect, LLC

January 28, 2021 Page | **3**

MOTION: Final approval of the ramp with staff condition number one; and deferral of front entry changes on existing materials and proposed finishes and details.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. Specify wrought iron railings at both ramp and stair, steering away from any steel tube.

- 2. Reuse the existing wrought iron rails where possible, and detail the new center rail at front to match existing scrollwork.
- Consult a stone conservator and implement investigation and preservation plan moving forward.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval with staff conditions.

8. 4 Gadsden - - TMS # 457-03-03-214

APP. NO. 2101-28-8

Request conceptual alterations to existing building including elevation for FEMA requirements.

Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. pre1902 Old and Historic District

Owner: Pate Dominick

Applicant: Evans and Schmidt Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments; and Board comment to limit elevation to

current FEMA requirements (+1-foot freeboard) at first floor; and final review by

staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

- 1. Add niches under windows at south elevation under windows.
- 2. Shutters must be operable; add hardware.
- 3. Shutter under porch should be bi-folding.
- 4. Simplify handrail and specify wrought iron.
- 5. West elevation crawl space door should be relocated or centered and detailed

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff comments and final review by staff.

9. 6 Gadsden - - TMS # 457-03-03-215

APP. NO. 2101-28-9

Request conceptual alterations to existing building including elevation for FEMA requirements.

Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. pre 1902 Old and Historic District

Owner: Pate Dominick

Applicant: Evans and Schmidt Architects

MOTION: C

Conceptual approval with staff comment number one; and Board comment to restudy foundation treatment at Gadsden Street to be less formal; and to limit elevation to current FEMA requirements (+1-foot freeboard) at first floor; and final review by staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR $\underline{5}$ AGAINST $\underline{0}$

Staff Comments:

- 1. Eliminate oval window on south elevation.
- 2. Eliminate bay at rear and replace with two double-hung windows.
- Reduce height and width of niches in front foundation wall, and study balance or alignment for windows above.
- 4. Develop the supports under porch to articulate more as columns rather than piers.
- 5. Provide additional recess or restudy the wood panel screening at front.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff conditions and final review by staff.

10. **29 Legare - - TMS # 457-11-04-105**

APP. NO. 2101-28-10

Requesting conceptual approval for modifications to north elevation including new construction of porte cochere, and extension of the existing elevator tower.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1835 Old and Historic District

Owner: Hillary Lamendola

January 28, 2021 Page | **4**

Applicant: Glenn Keyes Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments; Board comment to lighten appearance of

the porte cochere entablature to read more like a landscape-like pergola; and final

details to staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. This porte-cochere is reversible, does not affect the historic fabric of the building and staff are supportive. The utilitarian elements are simply detailed and respect the historic building.

The elevator tower seems logical and respectful as well.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final details to staff.

11. 43 -- 47 Broad Street - - TMS # 458-09-03-325

APP. NO. 2101-28-11

Requesting conceptual approval of new louvered screening at roof to conceal existing mechanical system.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1855 Old and Historic District

Owner: Vanderking 43 Broad, LLC

Applicant: JFM Architects

WITHDRAWN FOR STAFF REVIEW

Chairwaman, Lindsay Van Slambrook

January 28, 2021

BAŘ-S Administrator, Kim Hlavin

Date